
Subject: Context Menu request

Posted by [frankdeprins](#) on Thu, 22 Jan 2015 10:22:27 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Hello Mirek,

I noticed that the context menu handler (WhenBar) is called in the Right mouse Down event handler.

I think it would be better to do that in the Right mouse Up.

The reason is made clear with the following example:

Take an ArrayCtrl with a Context menu, right click on an item => the context menu is opened
With the menu still open, right click another item => the context menu closes but does not reopen for the newly selected item. So you have to do a second Right click on that item to get the Context menu for it. I think this is not really user friendly

I have tried this little modification in the ArrayCtrl and it does seem to work ok.

Best regards,

frank

Subject: Re: Context Menu request

Posted by [mirek](#) on Thu, 22 Jan 2015 13:31:03 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Hard to say. Current behaviour is consistent with e.g. GTK apps or OpenOffice.

It has advantage that you can choose menu item by releasing the mouse button.

Subject: Re: Context Menu request

Posted by [Klugier](#) on Thu, 22 Jan 2015 14:53:58 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Hello,

I need to agree with Mirek. Current "WhenBar" implementation is "international" standard (Mostly all GUI frameworks use this solution) and it shouldn't be changed. Maybe for some people your solution will be more intuitive, but habits acquired over the years are hard to change.

Sincerely,
Klugier

Subject: Re: Context Menu request
Posted by [frankdeprins](#) on Thu, 22 Jan 2015 15:14:19 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

I think you forget a small niche GUI: Windows
Just open an explorer, right click a file wait a bit and release the mouse button. You will notice it also opens the menu on mouse up, not down.

Subject: Re: Context Menu request
Posted by [Klugier](#) on Thu, 22 Jan 2015 15:58:17 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Hello frankdeprins,

It makes sense. It seems that default behaviour for M\$ Windows operating system family is behaviour you were talking about (I switched OS from Linux to test it). What is funny here is that GTK apps for example Firefox have got different behaviour on Unix like operating system and Windows.

Of course we can emulate this behaviour when Windows is detected by simply using "#ifdef" preprocessor macro. Example (pseudocode):

```
#ifdef PLATFORM_WINDOWS
    // Right up invokes context menu
#else
    // Right down invokes context menu
#endif
```

P.S.

This change should be carefully introduced (What happens with custom Ctrl's - Should we move WhenBar to Ctrl class to make it independent from operating system).

Sincerely,
Klugier

Subject: Re: Context Menu request
Posted by [bushman](#) on Thu, 22 Jan 2015 20:41:59 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

hi, there!

I've experimented right-clicking a couple "CtrlArray-like" Windows ctrls and, indeed, context menu

pops up after releasing RMB, but I honestly see no use in having it done this way, since you have to release RMB anyway, if you now decide to change selection, otherwise either you just drag selected object (when allowed), or you do nothing, but to cause Context menu to pop up at some other view area point and that's all. Curiously enough, I've been using Windows for some time now without ever noticing or bothering about this aspect, but now that you raised this point, I see that the way Upp does it is actually the best and more appropriate approach and I think the Windows way is rather wrong: one should be able to visualize and consult menu content immediately right after RMB click!

Thank you!

Subject: Re: Context Menu request

Posted by [mirek](#) on Fri, 23 Jan 2015 07:50:44 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Well, what is worth noting is that SOME windows apps, notable OpenOffice, open context menu on mouse down too.

Now I agree that ideal would be to be 100% compliant with look&feel of target platform, but such a goal is difficult to achieve. I think that something like this, when some small difference is noticed after 15 years for the first time, I guess I am good with it. Changing this has potential risk of breaking BW compatibility.

Subject: Re: Context Menu request

Posted by [frankdeprins](#) on Fri, 23 Jan 2015 09:27:39 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Hello Mirek (and others),

The fact that those differences exist on Windows is not that strange.

Those apps that are built directly on the Windows SDK or on some framework that follows it closely (like MFC), will show the behaviour as I mentioned. Those that are built on custom frameworks might not follow this convention.

Of course, even in the Windows SDK, the user can still react to WM_RBUTTONDOWN or WM_RBUTTONUP, but the proper way to handle it is in WM_CONTEXTMENU.

PS: Java (Swing) on Windows also follows the SDK convention.

I can see and respect the reason for not changing it though and hope you will not hold it against me if I change it on my local copy of Upp
