
Subject: smtp problem

Posted by [Zbych](#) on Thu, 09 Sep 2010 20:15:23 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Hi,

Do you guys know why Smtplib from Web package uses domain from e-mail "from" field in HELO command instead of client address or domain name?

When I send email with "from" field set to "xxx@poczta.onet.pl" Smtplib uses "poczta.onet.pl" in HELO command and server returns "553 5.7.1 Invalid EHLO command [HELO poczta.onet.pl], EHLO should contain FQDN, see RFC 2821"

What is more strange to me, if I replace client domain name with smtp server domain name (HELO smtp.poczta.onet.pl) everything is ok.

Is it normal behavior or this smtp server is odd?

Subject: Re: smtp problem

Posted by [Sc0rch](#) on Fri, 10 Sep 2010 06:12:15 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Zbych wrote on Fri, 10 September 2010 03:15:Hi,
Is it normal behavior or this smtp server is odd?

As I know, "from" field in Smtplib is just for information, maybe the package uses the part of string to define default SMTP-server (poczta.onet.pl). Always use domain/host method for alternative SMTP-server (in your case - smtp.poczta.onet.pl).

I don't have TheIDE at work =(sorry, if I wrong.

Best regards,
Anton

Subject: Re: smtp problem

Posted by [Zbych](#) on Fri, 10 Sep 2010 07:16:42 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Sc0rch wrote on Fri, 10 September 2010 08:12
maybe the package uses the part of string to define default SMTP-server (poczta.onet.pl)

Yes, it does:

```
String org;
int pos = from.Find('@');
if(pos >= 0)
{
    int start = ++pos, len = from.GetLength();
    while(pos < len && from[pos] != '>')
        pos++;
    org = from.Mid(start, pos - start);
}
else
    org << ipaddr;

SendRecvOK(socket, "HELO " + org + "\r\n", trans_ptr);
```

Question is why some servers reject this domain and accept smtp domain?

Subject: Re: smtp problem
Posted by [Mindtraveller](#) on Sat, 11 Sep 2010 15:14:58 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Servers usually accept login which is equal to "FROM:" record because of their internal options. It is done to fight spam and phishing. For example, one may send someone email and make FROM: admin@google.com with request to change user's password on some links which redirects to his deface/phishing resource. To prevent it, those mail servers which are well configured, prevent you from using names different from your login.

Subject: Re: smtp problem
Posted by [Zbych](#) on Sat, 11 Sep 2010 17:44:41 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Mindtraveller wrote on Sat, 11 September 2010 17:14 Servers usually accept login which is equal to "FROM:" record because of their internal options. It is done to fight spam and phishing.

HELO has nothing to do with authorization.
According to RFC 821 smtp client uses HELO to tell sever who he is (smtp client should send his ip address or domain name).

Quote:
5.2.5 HELO Command: RFC-821 Section 3.5

The sender-SMTP MUST ensure that the <domain> parameter in a HELO command is a valid principal host domain name for the client host. As a result, the receiver-SMTP will not have to perform MX resolution on this name in order to validate the HELO parameter.

The HELO receiver MAY verify that the HELO parameter really corresponds to the IP address of the sender. However, the receiver MUST NOT refuse to accept a message, even if the sender's HELO command fails verification.

DISCUSSION:

Verifying the HELO parameter requires a domain name lookup and may therefore take considerable time. An alternative tool for tracking bogus mail sources is suggested below (see "DATA Command").

Note also that the HELO argument is still required to have valid <domain> syntax, since it will appear in a Received: line; otherwise, a 501 error is to be sent.

IMPLEMENTATION:

When HELO parameter validation fails, a suggested procedure is to insert a note about the unknown authenticity of the sender into the message header (e.g., in the "Received:" line).
